

Challenges and Strategic Issues in Regional Development: Analysis of Regional Performance Enhancement Strategies

Husnah Husnah^{1,*} and Rosida P. Adam²

¹ Faculty of Economics and Business, Tadulako University, Palu, Indonesia

* Corresponding author: Husnah (husnahhusnah.untad@gmail.com)

Abstract

This research focuses on examining the challenges and strategic issues in the regional development of Palu, Central Sulawesi. Using a qualitative approach, the study identifies crucial issues and aspirations of the city's residents for the future. The research highlights five strategic issues, including environmental concerns, disaster management, economic growth, public safety, and governance, which have been identified as critical obstacles in achieving sustainable development in Palu. Through a comprehensive analysis of various sources, including literature studies, focus group discussions, public workshops, and surveys, the study develops a roadmap for Palu's development plan from 2021 to 2026. The identified strategic issues serve as key areas for targeted solutions to facilitate a more inclusive and sustainable future for the city. The research provides theoretical insights into urban planning and sustainable development practices and has practical implications for policymakers, aiding them in formulating effective policies. The recommendations offer a framework for regional performance enhancement, contributing to the achievement of the Sustainable Development Goals and the overall well-being of Palu's residents. By encouraging collaborative efforts between the government, civil society, and stakeholders, this study aims to create a better future for Palu and its citizens through strategic regional development.

Keywords

Regional development, Qualitative approach, Strategic issues, Sustainable development, Central Sulawesi

1. Introduction

The Law of the Republic of Indonesia No. 10 of 2016, which is the Second Amendment to Law No. 1 of 2015, addresses the establishment of government regulation regarding the election of Governors, Regents, and Mayors (Indonesia, 2015). This law outlines the process of selecting regional leaders, and one of the essential administrative requirements for candidate registration is submitting a vision and mission statement for the aspiring Regional Heads. During the campaign period, these vision-mission statements and work programs of the candidates are promoted. Furthermore, these statements are translated into a medium-term development planning document that spans a period of 5 years. These documents are of utmost strategic importance as they contain promises made by the elected Regional Heads and Deputy Regional Heads, which they are expected to fulfill by the end of their term (Gambo & Ribadu, 2015). The vision-mission statements serve as the foundation for the Regional Medium-Term Development Plan (RPJMD), which is a detailed elaboration of the Regional Heads' vision, mission, and programs. This plan includes objectives, targets, strategies, policy directions, and financial plans for regional development. Additionally, it encompasses programs for Regional Apparatus and cross-Regional Apparatus, accompanied by an indicative financing framework (Padli et al, 2021). The RPJMD has a 5-year duration and is guided by the Regional Long-Term Development Plan (RPJPD) and the National Medium-Term Development Plan (RPJMN). According to the laws and regulations, once the Regional Heads and Deputy Regional Heads are inaugurated, the local government must promptly establish a Regional Head Regulation (Perkada) concerning the RPJMD. This regulation, based on government guidelines, should be enacted no later than 3 months after the Regional Head's inauguration, as specified in Law No. 25 of 2004 (Indonesia, 2004). Additionally, as stated in Article 150 paragraph 3 letter e, RPJMD can be established through a Regional Regulation (Perda) in accordance with government regulations. According to the Regulation of the Ministry of Home Affairs No. 86 of 2017, RPJMD should be established within 6 months after the Regional Head's inauguration.

The Regional Medium-Term Development Plan (RPJMD) was crafted utilizing four different approaches: technocratic, participatory, political, and a combination of Bottom-Up and Top-Down Planning. The technocratic approach relies on scientific methods and frameworks to achieve the objectives and targets of regional development. In contrast, the participatory approach emphasizes a transparent and accountable process that involves stakeholders in decision-making at all planning stages. The political approach ensures alignment with the vision and mission of the elected Regional Heads and Deputy Regional Heads, subject to discussion with the Regional People's Representative Council (DPRD) and establishment through regional legislation. The combination of Bottom-Up and Top-Down Planning aims to synchronize and synergize national and regional development targets through consultations at the district/city level (Lukiswara, 2016).

While the timeframe for finalizing the RPJMD after inauguration is relatively short (6 months), the entire development process from data collection, processing, and analysis to drafting, discussions, and finalization, leading up to its establishment as the Regional Regulation on RPJMD, takes a considerably longer period (Fong, 2019). Thus, the Palu City Development Planning Agency (BappedaKota Palu) recognizes the need for early preparations, specifically in formulating the Technocratic Draft of the RPJMD for Palu City 2021-2026. The Technocratic

Draft of the RPJMD is a 5-year planning document prepared by the Local Government solely through the technocratic approach, before the elected Regional Heads and Deputy Regional Heads are inaugurated. This draft encompasses an analysis of the region's general condition, formulation of the financial overview, identification of regional development issues, review of other planning documents, and formulation of strategic regional issues, as described in Article 42 of Regulation of the Ministry of Home Affairs No. 86 of 2017. Although the Palu City Government has achieved significant progress in various aspects of community life, evidenced by improvements in several development indicators as outlined in the Palu City RPJMD document, the city still faces numerous challenges both from external and internal sources. These challenges encompass health, education, economic growth, per capita income, environmental concerns, and regional infrastructure, all of which constitute macro-level issues confronting the region (Idris, 2022). The aim of this research is to prepare the Technocratic Draft of the Regional Medium-Term Development Plan (RPJMD) for Palu City, covering the period 2021-2026. The study seeks to analyze the general condition of the region, identify development issues, and formulate strategic regional issues through a technocratic approach. By conducting early preparations and addressing challenges in health, education, economic growth, per capita income, environmental concerns, and regional infrastructure, the research aims to contribute to the establishment of effective policies and sustainable development strategies. The study recognizes the importance of timely and comprehensive planning to address the city's internal and external challenges and improve the overall well-being of Palu's residents.

2. Methods

The research methodology for formulating the Regional Medium-Term Development Plan (RPJMD) in Palu City involves a qualitative approach. Qualitative research is chosen as it allows for an in-depth understanding of the complexities and nuances involved in regional development planning. It focuses on gaining insights, perceptions, and interpretations of key stakeholders involved in the planning process. The qualitative approach is particularly valuable when exploring the various approaches used in the RPJMD formulation, including the technocratic, participatory, political, and Bottom-Up and Top-Down Planning methods. Data collection for this research is multi-faceted and involves gathering information from various sources. Firstly, in-depth interviews will be conducted with key stakeholders, such as government officials, local experts, community leaders, and members of the Regional People's Representative Council (DPRD). These interviews will help understand the perspectives and decision-making processes related to RPJMD formulation. Secondly, document analysis will be carried out, focusing on existing planning documents, previous RPJMDs, and relevant laws and regulations, including Regulation of the Ministry of Home Affairs No. 86 of 2017. The data collected from interviews and document analysis will be subjected to rigorous qualitative data analysis techniques. Thematic analysis will be employed to identify key themes and patterns related to the various approaches used in the RPJMD formulation. The researchers will immerse themselves in the data, coding and categorizing information to draw meaningful insights and interpretations.

3. Results and Discussion

Strategic regional issues can also be analyzed on a smaller scale, focusing on identifying problems based on governmental matters outlined in Law No. 23 of 2014, which defines the division of tasks and authorities between the central and regional governments in their governance (Indonesia, 2014). Concerning this, regional government responsibilities can be classified into mandatory government affairs, optional government affairs, and supporting government affairs (Asshiddiqie, 2015). Mandatory government affairs encompass matters that the regional government is required to handle, especially those related to providing essential services to the community in the area. Here are some of the development-related issues in Palu City concerning the mandatory government affairs and their association with basic services.

Table 1 discusses various aspects of the education system in Palu, Indonesia, specifically in the year 2018. It highlights the percentage of teachers who had not met the required educational qualifications, which was 15.65% at that time. The data also indicates that some schools still lacked the necessary accreditation standards. The data also provides information about the Achievement Performance Matrix (APM) for Basic Education in 2019. According to the APM, 92.86% of elementary schools and 76.88% of junior high schools achieved satisfactory performance levels. Additionally, the text mentions the School Dropout Rate in 2018, which was 18% for elementary schools and 12% for junior high schools. Lastly, it points out the existence of unmet Minimum Service Standards for education in Palu City, as specified in Ministerial Regulation No. 32 of 2018. This indicates that certain aspects of the educational services in the city did not meet the required standards at that time.

Table 1. Issues Related to Mandatory Government Affairs Concerning Basic Services

Scopes	Data	Issues
Education	2018: There was a 15.65% proportion of teachers who did not meet the required educational qualifications.	There are still teaching personnel who have not met the required qualifications.
	School Data	There are still schools that have achieved standard accreditation.
	Reconstruction and rehabilitation data	Post-disaster, there is damage to educational facilities and infrastructure.
	Participation Rate in Basic Education 2019 Elementary School (SD): 92.86%; Junior High School (SMP): 76.88%; Early Childhood Education (PAUD): (data missing)	There are still some Minimum Service Standards for education in Palu City that have not been fulfilled (Ministerial Regulation No. 32 of 2018).
	Dropout Rate 2018 Elementary School (SD): 18% Junior High School (SMP): 12%	
Health	2019: The number of specialist doctors: 165 (Based on the results of FGD, there is a shortage of specialist doctors in urology, pediatrics, and anesthesia).	Availability of specialist doctors at Anutapura Regional General Hospital in Palu City.
	2020: Number of Accredited Community Health Centers (Puskesmas): Basic Level: 4, Intermediate Level: 8, Not accredited: 2.	Improvement of community health centers' accreditation.
	2019: Waste: 1.84 (poor); Wastewater: 1.62 (poor); Drainage: 0.25 (very poor)	Improvement of sanitation index coverage.
	2019: Prevalence of wasting = Palu City: 12%; Central Sulawesi Province: 9.6%	Prevalence of wasting (underweight) in toddlers.

Public Works	2020: Total length of drainage: 1321.5 km; Good condition: 903.6 km; Fair condition: 78.2 km; Poor condition: 339.7 km.	The urban drainage system is not functioning optimally.
	2020: PDAM Donggala installed capacity 185.62 l/dt; Production capacity 154.42 l/dt; House connections 14,527; Service coverage rate 19.55% PDAM Palu= installed capacity 60 l/dt; Production capacity 47 l/dt; House connections 7,123; Service coverage rate 9.6%; Target for 100% piped clean water, achievement 29.15%.	Access to urban clean water services is not yet optimal.
	2019: Road length ratio: 0.145 (achievement: 65.91%).	The suboptimal ratio of road length to the population.

Based on data from BPS Kota Palu (2019), the number of specialist doctors in Palu City was 165. Based on the results of a Focus Group Discussion (FGD), there was a shortage of specialist doctors in the fields of urology, pediatrics, and anesthesiology. This impacted the availability of specialist doctors at Anutapura General Hospital in Palu City. Moving to 2020, there were a total of 14 accredited Community Health Centers (Puskesmas) in the city. Among them, 4 were accredited at the Basic level, 8 at the Intermediate level, and 2 were not accredited. This signified an improvement in Puskesmas accreditation, as more centers achieved higher levels of accreditation. Concerning environmental health, in 2019, Palu City faced challenges in waste management, wastewater treatment, and drainage. The waste management was rated "poor" with a score of 1.84, wastewater treatment was also rated "poor" with a score of 1.62, and the drainage system was deemed "very poor" with a score of 0.25. Efforts were made to enhance the coverage of the sanitation index in order to address these issues effectively (Rendy, 2015). In terms of malnutrition, the prevalence of wasting (underweight) in 2019 was 12% in children under five years old in Palu City. In comparison, the prevalence of wasting in the entire Central Sulawesi Province (Sulteng) was 9.6%. This data reflected the nutritional status of young children in the city and the province (Dinas Kesehatan Sulawesi Tengah, 2022).

Moreover, in term of public works, the length of drainage in Palu City in 2020 was 1321.5 kilometers. Out of this total length, 903.6 kilometers were in good condition, 78.2 kilometers were in moderate condition, and 339.7 kilometers were in poor condition. Despite the extensive drainage system, the urban drainage system was not functioning optimally, as a significant portion of the drainage was in need of improvement. Regarding water supply, in the same year, the capacity of PDAM (Public Water Utility) Donggala was 185.62 liters per day per person. However, the actual production capacity was 154.42 liters per day per person. The number of household connections was 14,527, resulting in a service level of 19.55%. In the case of PDAM Palu, the installed capacity was 60 liters per day per person, but the production capacity was only 47 liters per day per person. The number of household connections was 7,123, with a service level of 9.6%. The target for providing 100% piped clean water was only achieved to the extent of 29.15%. This indicated that the provision of clean water services in urban areas was still not optimal and required improvement. In terms of road infrastructure, in 2019, the ratio of road length to the population (0.145) achieved only 65.91% of the targeted level. This ratio suggested that the road infrastructure was not yet optimal considering the city's population.

The regional problems related to mandatory government affairs not related to basic services found in Palu City are presented in the Table 2. The data provided indicates the unemployment rate in Palu City over the years 2018, 2019, and 2020. In 2018, the open unemployment rate was

5.81%, which means that 5.81% of the labor force in the city was unemployed and actively seeking employment. However, the following year, in 2019, the unemployment rate increased to 6.32%. This rise suggests a growing number of unemployed individuals within the city. Unfortunately, the trend continued in 2020, with the unemployment rate reaching 8.38%. The continual increase in the unemployment rate points to an escalating issue of joblessness within the city.

Table 2. Problems in Palu City Related to Mandatory Government Affairs Not Related to Basic Services.

Scopes	Data	Issues
Workforce	The open unemployment rate in Palu City in 2018 was 5.81%, which increased to 6.32% in 2019 and continued to rise to 8.38% in 2020.	The high number of unemployed individuals and the lack of skilled professionals.
Empowerment of women and protection of children.	Violence against women: 2019: 85 cases 2020: 70 cases Representation of women: 2014-2019: 5 people 2019-2024: 4 people Violence against children: 2019: 59 cases 2020: 63 cases	The increasing violence against women The low representation of women in parliament The high level of violence against children
Food	The Food Pattern Score of Hope in 2018 and 2019 is still 90.4%. The data achievement for the year 2018 and 2019 is 2090 Kcal/Cap/Day.	The improvement of the Food Pattern Score of Hope (PPH) is not yet optimal. The per capita daily energy consumption of the population is not yet optimal.
Environment and Forestry	The percentage of waste that was managed in 2018 was only 37.18%. There were 44 units of Green Open Spaces (RTH) with an area of 51,899 square meters in 2018.	The waste management in the city is not yet optimal. The proportion of Green Open Spaces (RTH) has not been fulfilled.

Furthermore, the data emphasizes the importance of empowering women and protecting children from violence. The increase in violence against women and the relatively low representation of women in parliaments are issues that require attention and targeted interventions to ensure gender equality and equitable representation in decision-making processes (Umagapi, 2020). Additionally, addressing the persistently high levels of violence against children is crucial to creating a safe and nurturing environment for the younger generation (Bethell et al, 2017). These efforts are essential in fostering a society where women and children are protected, empowered, and their rights are upheld. In 2019, there were 85 reported cases of violence against women, while in 2020, the number decreased to 70 cases. However, despite the slight decrease, the issue remains concerning as violence against women continues to persist. The data also indicates the representation of women in the political landscape. From 2014 to 2019, there were five female representatives in positions of power. However, in the following period from 2019 to 2024, the number of female representatives reduced to four. This shows a relatively low representation of women in the local parliaments, suggesting a need for further efforts to promote gender equality and inclusivity in the political decision-making process. In term of violence

against children, there were 59 reported cases of violence against children in 2019, and in 2020, the number slightly increased to 63 cases. The consistent occurrence of violence against children highlights a serious concern for the well-being and safety of the younger population.

Moreover, strategic planning in regional resource strengthening economic resilience for quality growth in Palu to the strategic focus of this initiative revolves around addressing critical challenges to foster a robust and sustainable economic framework (Budianta, 2010). The first major issue is the sustainability of natural resources, as the availability of key resources essential for development is dwindling (Dutu, 2015). These resources not only serve as raw materials for domestic industries but also contribute significantly to foreign exchange earnings. In the effectiveness of economic resource, governance is another pressing concern, as managing economic resources faces obstacles related to environmental carrying capacity, land availability, infrastructure limitations, spatial planning, and the well-being of farmers, fishermen, and resource-dependent communities (Shobe, 2020). One notable challenge is the slow structural transformation since the reform era in 1998, Indonesia has struggled to sustain its socioeconomic transformation halted by the crisis. The potential economic growth rate has gradually declined from 6.0% in the 1990-2000 period to an average of around 5.0% in the 2000-2015 period. Several factors contribute to this decline, such as the quality of the workforce, low-quality investments with a smaller proportion of domestic direct investments compared to foreign direct investments, and suboptimal improvements in the quality of micro, small, and medium-sized enterprises (Sadli, 1998).

The advent of Industry 4.0 and the Digital Economy presents opportunities and challenges for Indonesia (Ameliany & Iryani, 2022, March). However, the country's readiness to adopt and explore digital technologies in governance, business models, and society is considered inadequate, hindering its ability to fully benefit from these transformative advancements. Developing Regions to Reduce Disparities and Ensure Equitable Distribution is a crucial aspect of this strategy (Wibowo et al, 2020). The primary aim is to diminish socioeconomic disparities between Java and non-Java regions while enhancing inter-provincial integration within each island and between islands concerning economic, socio-cultural, and infrastructure aspects. Another critical focus is enhancing quality and competitive human resources (Ellitan, 2020). Population control and strengthening population governance are essential to harness the potential of the large productive-age population, maximizing the demographic dividend. Proper management is vital to avoid high unemployment rates, social conflicts, and pressures on food and the environment (Robalino et al, 2009). However, expanding basic services and social protection is faced with challenges in harmonizing population data, as target determination relies on the population data, which is not reported, synchronized, or registered by many individuals. Social Protection for All Residents is a crucial objective, but not all poor and vulnerable populations have access to social protection, indicating the need for more inclusive policies. Fulfilling Basic Services is essential for equitable development, but not all residents have access to basic services according to the standards, resulting in suboptimal health conditions, maternal mortality, and stunting issues.

Moreover, enhancing the quality of girls and youth requires targeted interventions that cater to individual life stages and characteristics to ensure quality and competitive human resources (Gottschalk & Ortayli, 2014). Different approaches are necessary to guarantee the quality of life

for children, women, and youth, ensuring children's rights and protection and empowering women to participate in all sectors of development. Youth development is also vital for a nation's sustainability, as they are the future leaders and instrumental in optimizing the demographic dividend. In addition, poverty alleviation remains a priority, despite positive economic growth in the last decade, the elasticity to poverty reduction has decreased, leading to a slower decline in poverty rates. In term of improving productivity and competitiveness of Indonesian human resources is crucial to enhance overall economic performance, including building national culture and character to foster a strong national identity and preserve cultural heritage.

However, there are challenges in strengthening national cultural resilience, promoting Indonesian culture, and instilling stable character and ethical education. The issues include strengthening infrastructure to support economic development and provide basic services. Access to decent, safe, and affordable housing is limited, and the management of sustainable groundwater and raw water needs improvement. Enhancing infrastructure resilience to disasters, transportation safety and security, and the modernization of reservoirs and irrigation are also part of this agenda. In building environment and enhancing disaster resilience and climate change is crucial for the nation's sustainable development, as achieving an unachieved environmental quality index and disaster resilience is imperative (Cutter et al, 2008). Moreover, in strengthening political, security, and public service stability and transformation requires harmonizing regulations, effective corruption eradication, improving professionalism index of civil servants, responsive and inclusive institutional and business processes, and reliable performance accountability and supervision. The strategic regional issues in Palu encompass key matters such as the development of a new capital city, fostering cocoa-based and other agro-industries, establishing national food reserves, promoting marine and maritime-based industries, enhancing connectivity through infrastructure networks, and achieving the targets and goals of Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs). In the Draft Technocratic RPJMD of Central Sulawesi Province for 2021-2026, the focus is on inclusive economic growth, excellent human resources, regional infrastructure competitiveness, disaster mitigation, and achieving SDGs targets and goals. These strategies aim to propel the province towards sustainable and quality development, fostering prosperity and stability for the region.

4. Conclusion

The findings highlight the crucial issues and challenges that Palu is currently facing and the aspirations of its residents for the future. The identified strategic issues encompass environmental concerns, disaster management, economic growth, public safety, and governance. These issues will serve as a roadmap for the city's development plan for the period 2021-2026. By addressing these challenges and working towards the set aspirations, Palu can move towards a more sustainable and inclusive future. The recommendations for the strategic issues in the regional spatial plan and the strategic issues of Palu provide a comprehensive framework for sustainable development and progress. Implementing targeted solutions to these issues will contribute significantly to achieving the Sustainable Development Goals and improving the overall well-being of the city's residents. Collaborative efforts between the government, civil society, and various stakeholders are essential in realizing these goals and creating a better future for Palu and its citizens.

The findings on Palu's crucial issues and strategic challenges have both theoretical and practical implications. The identified strategic issues, ranging from environmental concerns to governance, provide a roadmap for Palu's development plan from 2021 to 2026. Addressing these challenges and pursuing the set aspirations can lead to a more sustainable and inclusive future for the city. The article's recommendations offer a comprehensive framework for sustainable development, aiding policymakers in formulating effective policies. By implementing targeted solutions to the identified issues, Palu can make significant progress towards achieving the Sustainable Development Goals and enhancing the well-being of its residents. Moreover, the findings underscore the importance of participatory planning, involving the community and various stakeholders. Collaborative efforts between the government and civil society are crucial in realizing the city's goals and creating a better future for all citizens. Overall, the findings contribute valuable insights into urban planning and sustainable development practices, which can be applicable to other cities facing similar challenges. By adopting a participatory and goal-oriented approach, cities can work towards a more resilient and prosperous future for their communities.

References

- Ameliyani, N., & Iryani, L. (2022, March). The impact of industry 4.0 in responding to the digital Economy's potential in indonesia at pandemic covid 19. In 2nd International Conference on Social Science, Political Science, and Humanities (ICoSPOLHUM 2021) (pp. 334-338). Atlantis Press.
- Asshiddiqie, J. (2015). Paradigma Baru Pembangunan Daerah. In *Makalah disampaikan dalam forum yang diselenggarakan oleh Pemda Provinsi Kalimantan Timur, Samarinda*.
- Badan Pusat Statistik Kota Palu. (2017). Jumlah Dokter Spesialis, Dokter Umum, dan Dokter Gigi Menurut Sarana Pelayanan Kesehatan di Kota Palu, 2016. Accessed on <https://palukota.bps.go.id/stactable/2017/06/08/531/jumlah-dokter-spesialis-dokter-umum-dan-dokter-gigi-menurut-sarana-pelayanan-kesehatan-di-kota-palu-2016.html>
- Bethell, C. D., Carle, A., Hudziak, J., Gombojav, N., Powers, K., Wade, R., & Braveman, P. (2017). Methods to assess adverse childhood experiences of children and families: Toward approaches to promote child well-being in policy and practice. *Academic pediatrics, 17*(7), S51-S69.
- Budianta, A. (2010). Pengembangan wilayah perbatasan sebagai upaya pemerataan pembangunan wilayah di Indonesia. *SMARTek, 8*(1).
- Cutter, S. L., Barnes, L., Berry, M., Burton, C., Evans, E., Tate, E., & Webb, J. (2008). A place-based model for understanding community resilience to natural disasters. *Global environmental change, 18*(4), 598-606.
- Dinas Kesehatan Sulawesi Tengah (2022). *Profil Kesehatan Provinsi Sulawesi Tengah / PENUTUP 220 - sultengprov.go.id*. Profil Kesehatan Sulawesi Tengah 2021. <https://dinkes.sultengprov.go.id/wp-content/uploads/2022/06/Profil-KEsehatan-2022.pdf>.
- Dutu, R. (2015). Making the most of natural resources in Indonesia.
- Ellitan, L. (2020). Competing in the era of industrial revolution 4.0 and society 5.0. *Jurnal Maksipreneur: Manajemen, Koperasi, dan Entrepreneurship, 10*(1), 1-12.

- Fong, C. (2019). Pembuatan Aplikasi E-RPJMD (Rencana Pembangunan Jangka Menengah Daerah) dengan Menggunakan Metode AHP (Analytical Hierarchy Process).
- Gambo, K., & Ribadu, A. (2015). Political Parties and Electioneering Campaign: Patterns and Dynamics. *Partenrs and Dynamics of Party Politics in Nigeria's Fourth Republic*, M. Habu, Ed. University of Dutse, 90-103.
- Gottschalk, L. B., & Ortayli, N. (2014). Interventions to improve adolescents' contraceptive behaviors in low-and middle-income countries: a review of the evidence base. *Contraception*, 90(3), 211-225.
- Idris, I. (2022). Tanggung Jawab Pemerintah Kota Palu Terhadap Pengelolaan Lingkungan Pada Sektor Pariwisata. *Tadulako Master Law Journal*, 6(2), 247-258.
- Law of the Republic of Indonesia No. 10 of 2016. Accessed on January 17, 2022 on <https://www.dpr.go.id/dokjdih/document/uu/1636.pdf>.
- Law of the Republic of Indonesia No. 23 of 2014. Accessed on January 18, 2022 on https://jdih.perpusnas.go.id/file_peraturan/UU0232014.pdf.
- Law of the Republic of Indonesia No. 25 of 2004. Accessed on January 17, 2022 on <https://www.dpr.go.id/dokjdih/document/uu/26.pdf>.
- Lukiswara, H. (2016). Analisis perencanaan pembangunan daerah dengan pendekatan sistem lunak di Kabupaten Trenggalek. *Jurnal Ilmiah Administrasi Publik*, 2(4), 216-226.
- Padli, N., Darmastuti, A., & Warganegara, A. (2021). Correspondence Theory Of Truth: Realisasi Janji Politik Kepala Daerah Terpilih Menuju Lampung Barat Hebat. *Jurnal Analisis Sosial Politik*, 5(1), 37-53.
- Rendy, M. (2015). Evaluasi Kebijakan Pengelolaan Sampah Di Dinas Kebersihan Dan Pertanaman Kota Palu. *Katalogis*, 3(11).
- Robalino, D. A., Vodopivec, M., & Bodor, A. (2009). Savings for unemployment in good or bad times: options for developing countries.
- Sadli, M. (1998). The Indonesian Crisis. *ASEAN Economic Bulletin*, 272-280.
- Shobe, W. (2020). Emerging issues in decentralized resource governance: environmental federalism, spillovers, and linked socio-ecological systems. *Annual Review of Resource Economics*, 12, 259-279.
- Umagapi, J. L. (2020). Representasi Perempuan Di Parlemen Hasil Pemilu 2019: Tantangan Dan Peluang. *Kajian*, 25(1), 19-34.
- Wibowo, E. B., Legionosuko, T., Mahroza, J., & Chandra Jaya, Y. (2020). Industry 4.0: challenges and opportunities in competency development for defense apparatus' human resources. *International Journal of Advanced Science and Technology*, 29(7), 45-60.